

Research Article

The Şūfī Semantics of (Waḥdat al-Wujūd) to Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn ‘Arabī

Mohamed Elnakep^{1,*} , Antonio Musarra² , Shalabi Elgeidi³, Paolo Branca⁴ 

¹Department of Islamic History, Faculty of Arts - Mansoura University, Mansoura, Egypt

²Department of Medieval History and Religions, Faculty of Philosophy and Literature - Sapienza University, Rome, Italy

³Department of Islamic History, Faculty of Arts - Mansoura University, Mansoura, Egypt

⁴Department of Islamic Studies and Arabic Literature, Catholic University, Milan, Italy

Abstract

The dialectic in the article research is the presentation of Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn ‘Arabī Şūfī semantics in (Waḥdat al-Wujūd), which forms the core of the dispute between conservatives (Ahl al-Hadith) and Şūfī. The statement of the Dialectic directs the reader to the importance of the topic, places the issue in a specific context, and specifies relevant criteria, providing the necessary framework for reporting the expected results. The idea of the Waḥdat al-Wujūd did not appear in a complete and consistent theoretical form before Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn ‘Arabī, some trends though appeared towards this theory from time to time in the sayings of the Sufis who preceded him. Ibn ‘Arabī’s doctrine of the Waḥdat al-Wujūd is summarized in his denial of the world of appearance and does not recognize the real existence except for God’s Creation as a show of true existence. So, according to Ibn ‘Arabī, there is only God, and through his doctrine of Waḥdat al-Wujūd, lies Ibn ‘Arabī’s understanding of the interdependent relationship between God, the world, and Al-Insān. This research discusses the dialectic of this doctrine through sources and texts that have been misjudged. So, this research article will follow the methodology of analyzing the Sufi texts of Ibn ‘Arabī, many subjects by Ibn ‘Arabī were discussed. Still, the research will concentrate on (Waḥdat al-Wujūd), because his experience with this subject had a clear influence on the philosophical thought in the whole world and the research deals with Ibn ‘Arabī’s doctrine of (Waḥdat al-Wujūd) which means the solitude of existence and the difference between it and the doctrines of Solutions and Union, Through 6 basic elements as follows: The name of the Waḥdat al-Wujūd: (The perfection in the Şūfī concept of (Waḥdat al-Wujūd) According to Ibn ‘Arabī, "There’s nonexistence but Allah") Then The Dialectic of Ibn Arabi: (The language of Ibn ‘Arabī) - (Similarities in Ibn ‘Arabī’s speech) Then Ibn ‘Arabī and symbolic thought Then Texts Ibn ‘Arabī’s literature on Waḥdat al-Wujūd Then The Insān al-kāmil and Woman in Ibn ‘Arabī’s thought Then after that Results and Discussions that the study reached from the previous elements.

Keywords

Ibn ‘Arabī, Waḥdat al-Wujūd, Şūfī, Insān al-kāmil

*Corresponding author: mohamedelnakep@mans.edu.eg (Mohamed Elnakep)

Received: 7 August 2024; **Accepted:** 3 September 2024; **Published:** 20 September 2024



Copyright: © The Author(s), 2024. Published by Science Publishing Group. This is an **Open Access** article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

1. Introduction

I'll present one of the greatest Ṣūfī philosophers, who is known as the great Sheikh/ Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn 'Arabī, the author of the famous works, which raised dialectic for some because of his ambiguous style based on symbols and indications. There are many subjects by Ibn 'Arabī which were discussed numerously. Still, the research will concentrate on (Waḥdat al-Wujūd), because of his experience with this subject and its clear influence on philosophical thought in the whole world, and the research deals with Ibn 'Arabī's doctrine of (Waḥdat al-Wujūd) which means the solitude of existence and the difference between it and the doctrines of Solutions and Union, and explaining Ibn 'Arabī's verbal style and his symbolic language, which was misunderstood, and received significant criticism from many holders of conservative religious idea, then the perfectionism in the Ṣūfī concept, and Ibn 'Arabī's vision of the perfect human and woman.

Waḥdat al-Wujūd in language: "He was alone, is alone, be alone, in a complete loneliness... Just by himself... God the someone, only one made him unique in his time ... the monism in philosophy: is a doctrine that gets the whole universe to one concept, as the mere soul or mere nature "[1] "Wāw (W), Jīm (G), Dāl (D): refer to one origin, which is finding the thing, exactly finding the lost thing." [2]

Waḥdat al-Wujūd idiomatically: a philosophical doctrine of Ṣūfī sm, says that God and the world are one truth and one entity, And God is the mere existence, they consider that God is the image of this created world otherwise the overall physical appearances announce the presence of God without being existed by themselves.¹

Waḥdat al-Wujūd in the Quran: The origin of Wujūd (found) exists in the form of past, present, and future. However, the origin (Wujūd) (existence) isn't mentioned in the Holy Quran, and it doesn't have any idiomatic meaning but keeps its previous linguistic content. In the past, "Every time, Zachariah entered Al-Mihrab to visit her, he found her supplied with sustenance: (al-Raḥmān: 37) In the present: "Indeed, there will never protect me from Allah anyone (if I should disobey), nor will I find in other than him a refuge." (Al-Jinn: 22). And in the future, "Mūsā said: if Allah will, you'll find me patient, and I will not disobey you in aught: (Al-Kahf: 69). [3]

2. The Name of the Waḥdat al-Wujūd

Ibn 'Arabī speaks about the Waḥdat al-Wujūd in the language of Ṣūfī experience and ranks, he says about the Ṣūfī folk: they are (the people of Waḥdat al-Wujūd) or (the people of precognition and The unveiling People)², he means to say

that: for those who find truth in their existence, listening gets them to the feeling it isn't truly perfect without the presence of the truth in it in an ambiguous way, and by this saying we can understand Ibn 'Arabī's sentences. [2]

For this name, some writers and thinkers said that Ibn Taymīyah was the first to use the name "Waḥdat al-Wujūd" to criticize these ideas and doctrines.³ [4]

Based on Waḥdat al-Wujūd, Ibn 'Arabī has inspired, lots of thoughts, real diversity, and multiplicity of reality which are one, in fact, because of Waḥdat al-Wujūd manifests inside nature's diversity and its effect and variety of lives around it. [5]

Therefore, nature and all inside it is an image of who has an essential, absolute, unlimited existence, the Almighty God. This agrees with the Ḥadīth Qudsī: "I was a hidden treasure, then I wanted to be known, so I created a creation to whom I made Myself known and knew Me." [6] Relying on believing in Waḥdat al-Wujūd, Ibn 'Arabī inspired lots of thoughts that real diversity or realism variety looks almost lonely when it's rooted in God with nature as a transfiguration for God, that manifests the variety of nature and the impact, but this variety is one because of Waḥdat al-Wujūd, Waḥdat al-Wujūd also is an appearance of everything while variety exists in its entities, which doesn't have its private existence, so God in his uniqueness is a synonym to the appearance of everything but he isn't the meaning of everything or the diversity itself. [7]

The truth is, that Waḥdat al-Wujūd is an old idea and the Ṣūfī Imams revived it but differently from atheistic materialism, of these Imams: Ibn 'Arabī, Ibn al-Fāriḍ, Ibn sab'īn, al-Tilimsānī, and many others who were influenced by Pla-

The unveiling is a light that occurs to those who walk on the path towards God; he reveals to them the veil of sense and removes the causes of matter away from them because of what they do as striving, solitude, and mentioning. And in the Almighty's saying: "And those who strive for us, we will surely guide them to our ways, and that God is with the doers of good." (Al-Ankabut: 69).

And Imam al-Ghazali (Hajjah al-Islam) said: (The slave from where he does not know and with the intensity of learning and cognitive diligence comes to him inspiration and puffs in terror like the revelation of the prophets and only the saints and the purists are concerned with this.)

³ Ibn Taimia has mentioned lots of sayings of the people of the waḥdat al wujūd doctrine, then he says: "Others make the most and possible existence equal to the matter and the image, the philosophers say that or close to that, as Ibn Sabeen and his followers say, but their sayings are full of contradictions and corruption, they aren't away from waḥdat al wujūd, or Solutions and Union, they believe in absolute advent, loneliness, and unity, contradicted with those who say the meaning such as the Christians and the extremists of Shiaa who believe in the divinity of Ali, Al-Hakim, Al-Hallaj, Yunis Al-Qeiny or others who have claimed divinity in them, those my belief in the restricted pantheism, and those believe in absolute and generalization. Because of that, they say that the Christians were mistaken about personalization. They also say that the problem of the polytheists was that they only worshipped some appearances, not the others and they believe in absolute infidelity and idolatry, and they generalize that. There's no doubt that this view is more corrupted than the view of Christians and Jews. This doctrine is taken by lots of the latecomers, and some parties of Jahamiya believe in it. And Ibn Arabī's sayings in the clothes of Wisdom, others, Ibn Sabeen's sayings, Al-Shushtry, Ibn Al-Fared's poem "Nathm Al-Suluk", Amer Al-Basri's poem, Al-Afif Al-Telmsani's sayings, Abdullah Al-Belbaly, Al-Sadr Al-Qwnawy and lots of others."

1 This is what was agreed by the people of Hadīth (the ancestors) and the modern researchers and scholars, Waḥdat al wujūd is a metaphor for Sufism.

2 Unveiling is physiognomy, and in language: verification and consideration, and in terminology, the people of truth: it's revealing certainty, looking into the unseen.

tonic and Stoics philosophy.⁴

The idea of Waḥdat al-Wujūd didn't appear in the form of coordinated doctrine before Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn 'Arabī and some of the ideas that rose towards this doctrine we find it occasionally in the preceded Ṣūfī s of Ibn 'Arabī, who wasn't the first to establish a full doctrine of Waḥdat al-Wujūd only, but he is still the great representative of it, and those who proceeded him and spoke about Waḥdat al-Wujūd were all influenced by him or reported from him. [8]

Confusion has happened among many scientists and researchers in understanding the theory of (Waḥdat al-Wujūd) according to Ibn 'Arabī because they mix the ways of Solutions, unity, and truth. This is testified by what is written in his books, he denies the unity through his saying: if the unity makes the two into one, it's impossible, because if the core of everyone exists during the unity, so they are two identities, and if one core ended and the other lasted, so the first has no limit. [9]

And it's known by the mind nature that existence is two kinds: a must existence for God and it can't be void, and an existence can agree to nonexistence, which is every other thing but God, nevertheless, many writers in the past and recently tried to negate that Ibn 'Arabī believed in Waḥdat al-Wujūd, because they thought that this doctrine is an atheistic materialism.⁵

It's known that God doesn't announce himself to other things, and the existence of God is absolute, so it can't be understood or imagined because he is the one, this is also according to the philosophy of Plotinus. [10]

One of the researchers looked that the Ṣūfī s believed that they were those pious, knowledgeable who understood the word, and Ibn 'Arabī's point of view taking this meaning into account, therefore he established the division of the existence into five sections:

1. Absolute existence which is the Almighty God.
2. Abstract existence of matter which is expressed in angels.
3. Existence that accepts being in space and place, which is the bodies, the bulk, and the core of persons.
4. Existence that doesn't accept being in place, but accepts it according to the features, such as black or white and anything similar.
5. Existences of kinship relations, which equal the ten philosophical sayings according to Ibn 'Arabī. [11]

4 It's a philosophy that prevailed in the context of Greek culture, in the 4th century BC, influenced by individualism and the effects of the technical development that resulted from the development of math knowledge, the Stoics assured that life must be lived according to nature, and they inferred that to the man as a model. What distinguishes a person is the mind which makes him able to control everything) 181.

5 A philosophical doctrine that is based on nihilistic idea, its origin is the denial of God's existence, and he claimed that The Universe was made without a creator and the matter is eternal and everlasting and it's the creator and the creation at the same time.

2.1. The Perfection in the Ṣūfī Concept of (Waḥdat al-Wujūd) According to Ibn 'Arabī, (There's no Existence but Allah)⁶:

The atheism idea of Waḥdat al-Wujūd was translated into the doctrines of Union Solutions, it's an old idea in some Hinduism and Taoism religions old Greek philosophies, and Jewish and Christian thought, too. [8] Its conclusion is: that its people were divided into two teams:

A team that sees God Almighty as a soul and the whole world as the body, thus if the man is purified, he transcends to stick to the soul which is God vanishes in it to reach great happiness.

Another group sees that God is everything and everything is God, which means that God is manifested in everything by himself and is as numerous as the number of images [12] this is contradicted by what Ibn 'Arabī says, He mixed Ṣūfī and Philosophy and came up with an integrated Ṣūfī doctrine on the nature of existence. He believed in Waḥdat al-Wujūd deciding that there's only one existence and it's God Almighty and all the others are his creation as he said in his books. [13]

Dr. Soaad Al-Hakim commented on Ibn 'Arabī Saying:

One who has no
unique qualities

They were amazed by the wisdom they found.

And they didn't find the merciful

This is monotheism; consider.

A one in the only one [14]

She says: "Actually, Waḥdat al-Wujūd here, if it's applied to the unity of Ibn 'Arabī, so it's one of monotheism's fruit according to Ibn 'Arabī. Monotheism is a comprehensive concept in Islamic thought as it's a doctrine pillar; rather it's the doctrine itself. Every Muslim proceeded with it as much as his ability and willingness, especially Ibn 'Arabī who proceeded with many kinds of monotheisms, specifically more than the definition and concept of monotheism during his behavioral and intellectual life, a result we can't classify his monotheism as theoretical and philosophical but explore it as theories and thought and he didn't fall in the pantheism or spoke under the heaviness of feeling, so we say: his monotheism is of mortals, no, he has the monotheism of the awaken looker, from here the disagreement took place among his learners". [2]

Ibn 'Arabī has denounced anyone who denies the existence of God or falls into polytheism, we infer from what he mentioned in verses at the beginning of chapter one hundred seventy-two "the chapter of knowing the monotheism."

Ibn 'Arabī says: that without the presence of the truth (God) in the creation by image, there would be no world. And but for these comprehensive reasonable facts, there wouldn't be a judgment in the kind, according to this fact, there was the lack of the universe to the truth in his presence."

6 The word one is contradicted by numerous, existence according to Ibn Arabi is one, so it's better to merge the from it and say, "oneness of existence".

[14].

Philosophy and theology used to differ between the ancient and modern existence, but Ibn ‘Arabī didn’t do that he believed in the ancient existence and negated the modern existence, there is no modern existence but modern existence. Here, he is differentiating between existence and existing, existing doesn’t exist according to a recent happening, but it exists according to the truth. [2]

The term existence was used by Ibn ‘Arabī to indicate the existence of God, the only existence of God and there is only one truth which is that God exists. However, he also uses this term to indicate any other term about God but metaphorically to assure that existence belongs only to God. Everything that has a form is a blessing from God, exactly as light only relates to the sun, God and nature were always depicted as like the relation between light and darkness because existence belongs only to God, then its absence belongs only to nature, therefore Ibn ‘Arabī argues that existence is light, and its absence is darkness. [14]

2.2. The Dialectic of Ibn Arabi

2.2.1. The language of Ibn ‘Arabī

The Ṣūfī language before Ibn ‘Arabī was based on one idea, it meant meditation and experience, together. In this period, the Ṣūfī s suffered because of their new expressions which were different from the known radical thoughts.⁷ As a result, the Dialectic of the Ṣūfī during this period was the expression, the vocabulary was numerous in a graduated sequence in a desperate attempt to seek congruence with the experiment. The letter or the word in their writing is beside what it means. Maybe this inability is according to their attempt to express their personal experience, which is individual, in a public language wasn’t equal to the experience. But Ibn ‘Arabī was one of the firsts who left the Ṣūfī with his Ṣūfī experience to analyze it and transfer it from the feelings and conditions field to Knowledge and theories. [2]

We find that Ibn ‘Arabī is away from atheistic thought.⁸, he was raised in an atmosphere full of faith and piety, his father was Ali Ibn Muḥammad one of Fiqh (jurisprudence) and Haditha (speech) Imams and one of the pioneers of asceticism, piety, and mysticism, and his grandfather was one

7 For example: the doctrine of Aḥl Al-Sunna has a view in the matter of nouns and adjectives, they believe in its literality without distorting, disabling, or personification, an example (The most merciful sat on the throne) Taha 5- (He has no identical and he is the All-hearing and seeing) Al-Shura 11- (his hands are outstretched) Al-Ma’eda 64. they have their know explanations for these verses, contradicted with Al-Mua’tazila, so they all agree that God has a hand, he sees and hears but they are different in understanding these things. some believe it literally; God has a hand, an eye, and a leg, but without distorting, disabling, or personification, others consider that the hand is God’s ability, and it isn’t a real hand but it’s his ability, here comes the difference in understanding the texts.

8 Ibn Arabi grew up in an atmosphere full of piety and faithfulness, his father was Ali bin Muhammad, one of Fiqh and Hadeeth scholars and one of the pioneers of asceticism, piety, and Sufism. His grandfather was one of the judges of Al-Andalus and its scholars. His uncles to his mother and father were pioneers of asceticism and piety.

of Andalusia judges and scientists, also his uncles were of people of asceticism and piety, [15] his thought has been clear since he was young, we can understand his spiritual upbringing through this situation which was between him and Ibn Rushd the great philosopher who asked his father to bring him, then asked him: how did you find out about revelation and divine efflux and if it was what gave him the sight? [16] Muḥyī al-Dīn replied him: Yes and no, and between yes and no, the souls leave their materials and necks leave bodies [17]. This situation proves that he has been inspired since his childhood, Ibn Rushd’s question was: Is the summit that philosophy reached by mind and thought, is the summit that the Ṣūfī reached by abstraction and mention? It is as if he wanted to make sure that the summit reached by philosophy is the desired one of the religions. He aimed through his philosophy to match religion and philosophy⁹.

Therefore, we find that Ibn ‘Arabī, since his childhood had a standing thought which Cordoba philosopher unable and obliged him to objective confession in his private boards which represents the dedication of his loyalty to a new stream in Ṣūfī thought. [18]

When we think about Ibn ‘Arabī’s saying: (between yes and no, souls fly) he means a deep meaning, because the mind may lend to God, realize, and reach the secrets of the universe, but when the abstract mind reaches this summit, it descends, slips and strays among similarities.

It is important here to notify you that Ibn ‘Arabī took up Waḥdat al-Wujūd in a new philosophical, eloquent way, in a more symbolic way to meanings that may be understood in a wrong way, and this explains to us the Dialectic that can be seen in Ibn ‘Arabī’s style and symbolism in his words.

It’s important here to mention an important subject, which it’s the difficulty for the critics to analyze Ibn ‘Arabī’s symbols because of their abundance and immensity and his symbolic behavior which hid the meaning and resulted in hiding the idea, which made some people understood what he said in undesired meaning.

2.2.2. Similarities in Ibn ‘Arabī’s Speech

There’s no doubt that Ṣūfī has its idioms, symbols, and a language in which they are specialized, so if there’s an argument on some of its meanings, we should refer to its writers and the knowers of its secrets, for they said: “our books are not allowed for others.

An example of Ibn ‘Arabī’s similarities which he explained by himself:

Oh, who sees me, and I don’t see him?

How often do I see him, and he doesn’t see me?

Some of his followers asked him, how do you say: he doesn’t see you and you see him?

9 When we look into Ibn Arabi’s saying: (between yes and not the souls fly away) it’s as if he means a deep meaning because the mind can lead you to God and realize the secrets of the universe, but when the abstract mind reaches this summit, it begins to slide and misleads with similarities.

At once, he said¹⁰:

Oh, who sees me as a criminal?
And doesn't see you as a punisher.
How often I see him generous.
And he doesn't see me as a refugee.

Here, Al Muqarri, (the author of Al-Nafh Al-Tayeb) said about the previous saying: "Thus, we know that the words of Al-sheikh peace be upon him, are ambiguous and not plain. But it has inner meanings, so think well, or believe well. And the people have lots of speech in this meaning, and surrendering is preferable, and God is the knower of his righteous speech". [11]

So, there must be an intellectual background to enable the researcher to understand Ibn 'Arabī's idioms and his sentences' symbols. He has an "Ajurrūmīyah" to explain his ideas in an intellectual system, that he is in his thought and culture is a kind of "stinted on his people" therefore those who aren't his people were confused about his sayings.[11]

Thus, we don't find it strange when we see the spread of these sayings in the Sūfī culture; they prevailed long ago, then appeared on the horizon of Islamic thought and formed the doctrines of emanations, radiance, knowledge, Solutions, and Unity, and unity of existence and all the components of theosophy.¹¹ Influenced by the mixed ideas of the ancient oriental Gnostic¹² [19], and if we look into the doctrine of platonic emanation – we find that God, the first mind, the whole soul, the non-pictured item, and the partial soul – all these are the ranks of existence according to Plato, and this is similar to Ibn 'Arabī's school. [20]

Ibn 'Arabī's language didn't have the chance to be studied independently of some speakers, the debaters of his ideas, so no one took from them their vocabulary or idioms for example, to demonstrate the inherited and the modern and how it was formed. And is it just an ancient language and he stamped it by his characteristic? Or did he develop it and produce a new language of his own? However, some studies investigated these important characteristics.

3. Ibn 'Arabī and Symbolic Thought

Ibn 'Arabī is specialized in symbolic thought; he may not mean the direct meaning that comes to one's mind.

Dealing with Ibn 'Arabī's language stopped at his ambiguous style, Abu Al Ela Afifi sees that Sūfī, in general, speaks symbolically and in signs, determining that the other people won't understand them, the general language doesn't fulfill

10 When we investigate Ibn Arabī's reply which he mentioned to clarify the meaning of his words, then we measure the other whole semantic terms, we will find an important result that the apparent words aren't the wanted meaning.

11 A religious philosophical term that means the divine wisdom

12 Gnosis is a Greek word that means direct intuitive knowledge that doesn't depend on the means of the inferred mind. It targets only the knower and the known and it isn't known for sure whether its source was Plato, Persia, or India, and in the view of some researchers, it's a human heritage that doesn't rely on a specific human heritage, but it's a religious heritage. It's from inspiration, and it has the names of human heritage and it's there in the wakefulness or sleep, so it isn't dependable to find in a time of need.

the explanation of its meaning. [21]

If we investigate Ibn 'Arabī thought about Waḥdat al-Wujūd and read his speech about the oldness and start of the world, we see that he deals with existence as connected with God's will, as he sees himself as transfiguration in the mirror of the world.

Abū Zayd has written a whole chapter in his book "Interpretation Philosophy" entitled "Existence and Language" speaking about Ibn 'Arabī's language and its parallel to existence. [22]

Ibn 'Arabī concludes that there's no value to our question about when the world was created. Because "When" refers to time, and time is always considered a product of the virtual world by Muslim intellectuals, there's no time sequence between the creator and the creature but there's a logical order of mind and dimension not in time, that means that the relation between God and universe is like the relation between yesterday and today. [23]

4. Comparing and Contrasting Ibn 'Arabī's Ideas with Those of Other Sufi Scholars

There was a great dialectic around the thought and language of Ibn 'Arabī and what was understood from his apparent saying, therefore, some people went to atone and accused him of heresy and atheism such as Sirāj al-Dīn al-Bulqīnī, Tāj al-Dīn al-Subkī, The judge Bder al-Dīn ibn Jamā'at, Ibn Taymīyah, al-Dhahabī, and many others.

Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūfī defended him and wrote a book entitled (Alerting the Ignorant to the Innocence of Ibn 'Arabī) as a reply to the book of Burhan Al-Dīn Al Beqaai (idiot alert to atone of Ibn 'Arabī), also 'Abd-al-Wahhāb al-Sha'rānī wrote (the rubies and jewels in explaining the beliefs of the great ones) and (the red sulfur in explaining the sciences of the great Sheikh) and (An alert to the fools on a drop from the knowledge sea of saints)

Also, al-Fayrūz abādy replied to the subject of Ibn al-Khayyāt and clarified the Dialectic by saying: "I don't know If ibn Al-Khiat found these subjects in a false book of the Sheikh or understood the speech of the Sheikh against what he meant or innovated it by himself". [24]

This is evidence that there were false speeches Needed for Ibn 'Arabī's speech, as Al-Boti mentioned, or understood from him. Besides that, his language and idioms are full of intensification, focus, and mystery, especially in the cloves of wisdom. [25]

And it was said: "Often the hearts of the knowers are blown by divine sighs, and if they utter it, those who don't know will be ignorant of them and the people of the evidence reject it from them." For this Ibn 'Arabī says: "Know that if the lover says: I'm the one whom I love, and the one I love is me, these words were in the tongue of adoration and love not in the tongue of science and investigation that he may not

retreat what he said when he awakes his status, and love has an excusable soul because it's forced by its status". [26]

Therefore, Al-Tusi signaled out in his book (brilliance in *Ṣūfī sm*) a book which he called "the book of explaining what is apparent of words that seem to violate the Islamic Law, and its inside is right straight". [27]

5. Texts Ibn 'Arabī's Literature on *Waḥdat ai-Wujūd*

Here we can mention some of what Ibn 'Arabī said in his book (cloves of Wisdom and Meccan Conquests) and what may be understood from his apparent words:

He says: "The lowest who imagined in him – which means in every object – divinity. Without this imagination, the stone or anything else wouldn't have been worshipped". [15]

It means that everything for him is a God and divinity, but he intended something else as a reason of symbolism in his style, he meant proving the divinity, ability, and almighty of God in creating his creatures.

And he says: "The rule of numerals didn't come without the existence of numerable, nothingness and existence, the thing may not here for the feeling but it's here mindfully, so the numeral must have a numerable=, and there must be a one to create that, it's created because of him, every level of number is a fact, one is as nine and ten (fewer or more and to the infinity), what is collected and inside them the one's collector". [15]

It represents the relation of God with his creation, as the relation of numerical number one with numbers, and we can explain that by saying if we subtract number one from one, it becomes zero, and if we find one, it becomes two, and thus forever. The origin of numbers is one, and the origin of creation for Ibn 'Arabī is God.

He says: "All that you realize is the presence of God in the eyes of his creation, whereas the identity of God, it's his presence, while the images and its differences of him, is the eye of his creation, as the name of the show doesn't disappear from him when the images differ, the name of the universe doesn't disappear from him". [15]

The presence of God is the mere presence of creation because, without the presence of God, there will be no creation. Also, he meant here something else, that the proof of God's existence is a proof of the creations' existence.

Also, in the emulation between man and divinity truths, Ibn 'Arabī wants to say that our knowledge of God's attributes is from the attributes that God put inside us.

So, if we didn't know our existence, we wouldn't know the meaning of existence and say that the creator existed. [28]

**And he says: "There is no near closer than his identity being the core of the strength and organs of the slave, and the slave is nothing but these organs and strength" [15] and it means that the identity of God is the core of the slave's or-

gans and strength. But he might mean that the almighty God is a helper of his creation in every obedience, the prophet's speech indicates this; Abū Hurayrah the prophet quoted that God said "That who hostiles a believer of me, I start a war on him, and my slaves will never approach me by something I love, more than what I imposed, and my slave will continue to approach me by voluntary deeds, till I love him when I love him, I'll be his hearing, sight, the hand which he uses and the foot which he walks on, and he asks me, I'll give him, if he wanted guardianship, I'll protect him, and the only thing I hesitate upon when he comes to die, and he hates dying, so I hate to disturb him." [29]

And he says: "Say in the universe, what you say, if you wish, say he is the creation, say he is the God (truth), or say he is the God creation" [15]. He means here that the universe is God, the relation between God and his creation isn't separated or divided, and the presence of creation is proof of God's presence.

He also said in the chapter of prophet wisdom in Christ's word:

If we truly worship and Allah is our sanctuary

I am his eyes that know if you say a human.

Don't prevent a man who has your proof.

Be a truth and be a creation you'll be with God's merciful [15].

Here he says that the slave's action is just the action of God. But we can explain that the slave can have the attributes of God, and as God can do severe punishment, he is also merciful and forgiveness, so the slave can have these attributes from God, the requirement here is to be on the attributes of God, don't be away of them to get all the good and be on the path of the righteous.

In the chapter of merciful wisdom is Solomon's word: "The work is divided for eight organs of the man, and the almighty God has said that he is the identity of every organ of them" [15], and it's understood here that God is the identity of every organ of the human being, As I mentioned before, the meaning isn't as.

Ibn 'Arabī mentions in his mono-message: "... there isn't anything if it won't perfect his specialty, besides he can't perfect it if no one can see it whether it's a prophet, a messenger, a guardian, or angels. [30]

Here we can say that: *Waḥdat al-Wujūd* according to Ibn 'Arabī, is the origin that came out of it, his understanding, perception, and realization of many issues related to ethics, religions, and kinds of human knowledge, human and divine conditions, the affairs of the world and the hereafter, also other questions which.

can be noticed without effort by looking into the Meccan conquests and the cloves of wisdom¹³.

13 From the statement of Ibn Arabi, we can conclude that all the way (religions) are from one God although the Islamic legislation is different; the difference is that God gave to every prophet a way to the God, and every way is different from the other. Also, the religious belief that manifests in love, thus every religion assures the kind of faith as a base to his relation with other religions, that is because the real human relation with God in God's doctrine, so it means that the presence of God is

6. The Insān Al-kāmil and Woman in Ibn ‘Arabī’s Thought

6.1. The Insān Al-kāmil in Ibn ‘Arabī’s Thought

The perfect human (Insān al-kāmil) in the sight of Ibn ‘Arabī is the full transfiguration of God himself, or represents God in this world, versus with the world which represents the face of creation, and when the world loses the man, it is a body without a soul.¹⁴. [31]

The perfect man in Islamic metaphysics (Islamic Šūfī sm). Specifically, Ibn ‘Arabī thought that human attorney was divided between both God and Man, and Man must seek perfection to be an ideal man, so passes the existence circle and returns as the perfect one “which means the soul that moves the universe”. [32]

Ibn ‘Arabī sees that Allah created Muḥammad with both hands, thus he acquired honor, and he gathered the two images, the image of the world and God, this happened in considering that each hand of God was for one of his creations. [15] The first one created the spirit world and the other created the world of Waḥdat al-Wujūd, man was created by both, and because of this he became God’s caliph and has in him what is needed if spiritual or physical, so he isn’t in need to this, and he named him the perfect man¹⁵. [33]

Ibn ‘Arabī’s idea about the ideal man (the Perfect Man): was centered on the presence of spiritual authority, he also believed that wisdom started with Muḥammad and ended with Muḥammad, and he believed that Muḥammad was created in the image of God, and he was the first perfect man, and he says: the Universe was completed by the presence of Muḥammad. Therefore, we can indicate that the presence of a man in God’s presence is a perfect or an ideal man, the ideal man is like the bridge that ties divinity with the universe. [34]

Ibn ‘Arabī explains that man in his upbringing held everything in the divine image as the qualities and names transfiguration, as Al-Nabulsi says in his explaining to the cloves: inwardly equivalent to the divine presence and outwardly to the cosmic presence, he draws from God and provides the universe: he is the isthmus between God and the creation.

based on love and God’s desire to be known and admitted by his creatures, that’s is the most important messages and it should be practiced by those who believe in a life full of diversity even for the Sufis, the poems of love may reflect an experience that God is perfect, and this reinforce the depth of the experience and contains a kind that has no end and can penetrate the religious shape limits to hold the deep inner meanings.

Look at this: Idries Shah, Mahkota Sufi: Menembus Dunia Ekstra Dimensi. Translated by M. Hidayatullah and Roudlon (Surabaya: Risalah Gusti, 2000), p 192-193.

14 Ibn Arabi considers that all existences are gathered in only man, and it’s divided in the world, so if the Holy Spirit blows in the man, he joins the absolute existence, in a holy morally way which is his part of divinity.

15 Ibn Arabi considers that the human soul is derived from the Muhammadian soul that exists in the whole world, so it’s right to say that the world and the man were created upon God’s image and also the Muhammadian truth image, and the whole world was done in details according to that image but divided into the human image, it was as clothes on the Muhammadian illuminati truth

Among these metaphoric effects, is the tendency of the reality about the Muahammadian light and the term of Muḥammadian truth of guardianship idea and the prophecy which didn’t stop or end and the relation between both and the Šūfī dispute about the relation of the prophecy and the guardianship. The evolution of the Muḥammadian light idea or the Muḥammadian truth to the idea of the perfect man or the Divine Man. [20]

One of Ibn ‘Arabī’s pillars of thought is glorifying the holy prophet (peace be upon him), and what was said including the symbolism of the perfect man a part of the symbolism of Waḥdat al-Wujūd, which of its mechanisms, is the God’s transfiguration in the creation to be a triple (God, the world, and the man) but the perfect man represents isthmus between God and the World.

Ibn ‘Arabī says: “the perfect man” (Insān al-kāmil): the divine image is fulfilled to him and isn’t being full without this rank” [29]

According to Ibn ‘Arabī, man is divided into two parts; the first is the real man, and the other: is the perfect man. The real one is the man as he is, without any try to achieve his latent capabilities, but the perfect one is the one who could achieve his self-perfection.

We find that Man according to Ibn ‘Arabī’s thought, is a perfect man on both sides (Divinity and Humanity), even though (God, Man, and the world) are all one at its core, they are three aspects under one idea, and Man is the mediator between God and the Universe. He is the God’s successor. [33]

There are at least three ideas from Ibn ‘Arabī’s concept about the perfection of humans and they are:

First: People are responsible for their deeds, intuitive communication with God is an appearance of the appearances of their reality and fatalism to do good things, and from here was the saying, “That who knows himself, knows his God.

Second: When people make a mistake, God isn’t responsible for that because they can choose the judgment and resist the wrong.

Third: The idea of the ideal man prevailed metaphysical thought of Ibn ‘Arabī, the concepts of paradise and hell must be understood upon human deviation, which means the destiny of people can’t rely on hell’s torment for every human. In other words, even those who are in hell will be under the possibility of angels, prophets, and saint’s mediation to free them of hell and enter paradise. [35]

6.2. The Woman in Ibn ‘Arabī’s Thought

Ibn ‘Arabī’s speech starts upon human, ideological formats that were contemporary or preceded him without losing his creativity or particularity, among the ideas and cases that state the particularity of Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn ‘Arabī’s thought is the question of femininity and masculinity, and this question is in the preceded thought to Ibn ‘Arabī without announcing

it to be stamped in an apparent intellectual way; the conceptual pair (femininity/masculinity) is deep in Ibn 'Arabī's thought on the ontological, cosmological, anthropological, intellectual and linguistic levels... and this thought is clear and profound to an extent that can be considered a feminine speech and an indication of the validity of this hypothesis, is what Ibn 'Arabī symbolizes when he deals with the subject of woman.

We hear a lot that Ibn 'Arabī elevates the status of "female and feminism", and there's a famous saying of his that says: "Everything that is not feminine is unreliable". This desirable subject may be strongly clear in the last chapter of the Cloves book, he says in one of his texts "Since loving is the origin of the existence, God has made his prophet Mohamed loved three things: women, perfumes and prayer"¹⁶

Ibn 'Arabī starts the last chapter by speaking about women and assuring the individual truth, which is the Muḥammadian Light, the most perfect creation that God appeared, she is the perfect human in whom the meaning of succession is realized in its most accurate characteristics.

This truth is a must to understand the image of woman according to Ibn 'Arabī through what he presents for the prophet's speech: "Three things of your world have been made dear to me: women, perfume, and my dearest is the prayer". The title of the clove is "a clove of an individual wisdom in a Muḥammadian word", this means it was especially to speak about the Muḥammadian truth. However, all that came under this title is an explanation of this speech and this doesn't mislead the truthfulness of the title because Ibn 'Arabī wants to state generally that the position of woman is connected existentially to human perfection, which is incarnated as the prophet peace is upon him, so there is no perfection for a man without a woman and vice versa according to each side existence's proportion because Ibn 'Arabī's speech is in the absolute, or about the origin of the relation between man and woman. Hence, the speech in the clove is mingled with the Muḥammadian truth; the symbol of human perfection, when he speaks about women in the way of the plural that has no singular and refers to the whole woman not just one of them. [15]

As noticed, women were before perfume and prayer itself. According to Ibn 'Arabī woman has been a part of man since her first appearance, and knowing the part which is the woman, is preferred to knowing the whole which is the man as one of humans, and knowing the human is preferred over knowing God because knowing his God has resulted from knowing himself. Because of this, the Hadith says: "Those who know themselves, know their Gods." [15]

The woman wasn't absent from Islamic Ṣūfī in general or Ibn 'Arabī, because Ibn 'Arabī was affected by old philosophies as he mentioned, it has come to the point that the orientalist Platheus mentioned that there are similarities between Ibn Arabi and Saint Teresa in the Divine presence. [36]

We also found that Ibn 'Arabī appreciates the well-known mystic Rabī'ah al-'Adawīyah and her divine love for the Almighty God. [37]

Existence, at its core, was based on love. Hence, love is a divine shrine, God the Almighty called himself the affectionate "Al-wadood", and in the Quran "love" was mentioned in many ways to indicate love between God and his creation. Love is the origin of all existence as Ibn 'Arabī says, according to Ḥadīth Qudsī which is common among Ṣūfīs and is attributed to the prophet peace is upon him that the Holy God says: "I was a hidden treasure, then I loved to be known, so I created the creation, by this they knew me or by me, I was known." [38] The findings weren't transported by force into existence but for the favor of divine love, and after getting the order whereas it was in the divine knowledge, ready for the universe: "His command, if he wants something, is to say to it, Be, and it is" Yasin /82.

Women in Ibn 'Arabī's Ṣūfī aren't according to their beauty or their passion for God, but because they know and on the divine way. She also cares about the possibility of reaching perfection' [39]

Ibn 'Arabī also admits the right of the woman to lend the prayers because according to his point of view, he didn't find proof of this elimination in God's words; "The Holy Quran". [39]

Here, Ibn 'Arabī wants to mention that a woman can reach perfection exactly like a man, and it's noticed that Ibn 'Arabī was brought up by two of the most virtuous Ṣūfī women, Fatima Al-Cortobia, a Ṣūfī woman sheik raised him for two years and Ibn 'Arabī calls her, Tuna. The other one is in Mershana and is called Jasmine and he calls her Sun, the mother of the poor. [40]

The writer Nuzhat Rāḍh mentioned that: womanhood is a central corner in Ibn 'Arabī's thought, she considered that his speech reflects comprehensively the womanhood speech. The presence of womanhood in his speech penetrates his conception about existence, the universe, language, gratitude, behavior, and imagination, and their humanity mixed with their existence" [41]

In this situation, Ibn 'Arabī says: "Witnesses of the truth of women are the greatest witnesses and the most perfectionist". [15]

7. Results and Discussions

- 1) There is always confusion about the concept of Waḥdat al-wujūd among a lot of researchers and some intellectuals who translate Waḥdat al-wujūd into the Western idiom "panentheism", and this is wrong.
- 2) The study of Waḥdat al-wujūd in an integrated way

¹⁶ akhrajahu al-nisā'ī fī Sunanihi (7/61) Ḥadīth No. (3939), checked by: 'Abd al-Fattāh Abū Ghuddah, Maktab al-Maṭbū'āt al-Islāmīyah, Halab, ed.2 -1406h=1986AD, wa-Aḥmad fī musnaduh (20/351) Ḥadīth No. (13057) bnḥwh, checked by: a group of checkers under the supervision of / 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abd al-Muḥsin al-Turkī, Mu'assasat al-Risālah, Bayrūt, ed. 2-1420h=1999AD. In them: my most beloved thing is the prayers, wḥsnh al-Albānī fī taḥqīqihī lmskhāh al-Maṣābiḥ lil-Tibrīzī without the word (three) (3/448) Ḥadīth No. (5261), al-Maktab al-Islāmī, Bayrūt, ed.3-1985AD.

needs huge and numerous efforts, and needs to be treated from different aspects since it's one of the basics of *Ṣūfī*, and comparing what is said about this idea in different civilized areas makes it difficult to make sure of an objective matter far from fabrication, or saying without knowing the truth or taking the recent for preceded, or trying to treat the phenomenon in a kind of fragmentation and generalization which eliminates the essence of the matter.

- 3) There is an associative relationship between God and humans that can't be understood without the doctrine of *Waḥdat al-wujūd* that was adopted by Ibn 'Arabī, God the creator who founded the world, wanted to see his transfiguration, which means to see himself, so the world was as his name and redundant traits image.
- 4) What caught my attention, is the great repetition of using the name "truth" instead of the name "God" by Ibn 'Arabī in the book *Fuṣūṣ al-ḥukm* – this resulted- as I think- that Truth indicates the real eternal existence, of the other side of the existence which is resulted from it, which contradicted it in its traits and divine attributes, and what is impossible and can be understood as the divine existence, and is followed by the redemption, knowledge, ascending and the right position way. All of this supports what we mentioned in our speech about the principle of *Waḥdat al-wujūd* and its contradicted and conductivity characteristic, only God knows.
- 5) The Educational Philosophy of Ibn 'Arabī was based on mere Islamic *Ṣūfī* criteria, and in his life, he stuck to the Islamic morals, deepened in his spiritual experience, knowing it's apparent and inside, maybe the difficulty of his books, is the reason that made the scholars differed in his matter, and think about him in numerous ways, a sect said that what he says is infidelity, and others differed from them and interpreted for him.
- 6) I think that Ibn 'Arabī and those who followed him as the *Ṣūfī*, resorted to the indicative style because they were careful not to clash with the conservative fundamentalist doctrines which was prevailing in the community at that time.
- 7) The nature of the environment that Ibn 'Arabī was raised in, took part in his formation, nature is the second mother for any human in this universe, and he absorbs life concepts from it to continue living, he was raised in Al-Andalus where he secretly learned the ambidextrous doctrine which is full of symbols and interpretations which were inherited of Pythagorean, Orphian and Indian Innate and there is no doubt that his innate readiness and his upbringing in a religious atmosphere, also his constant going to the symbolic schools, all of this participated in distinguishing his intellectual and spiritual side at an early age, and he began to know the secrets of the *Ṣūfī* life and he kept working on that till he got the greatest number of secrets.

- Ibn 'Arabī speaks about the language of *wujūd* in the language of experience *Ṣūfī* and stations.

- Ibn 'Arabī combined *Ṣūfī* and philosophy and came out with a complete Sufi doctrine like *wujūd*, and headed towards *Waḥdat al-wujūd*, deciding that there is one true existence, which is God Almighty, and everything else is creation.

- Ibn 'Arabī was one of the first Sufis to separate his experience *Ṣūfī* to analyze it and move with it from the field of ecstasies and states to the logic of science and theories.

- The language of Ibn 'Arabī has not received independent study from some of those who have spoken about him or have discussed his ideas.

8. Conclusion

- 1) Ibn 'Arabī knowledge in Qurtubah of the books of the Persian and Greek philosophers and others was the reason for his passion to learn about all the degrees of asceticism in all religions and sects through their scholars, this contributed to giving him a unique form in his language, terms and his expressions and so on.
- 2) The relationship connecting Ibn 'Arabī with the Greek, Jewish, and Christians and the various philosophical doctrines of mystical nature and illuminating trends in knowledge is what made Ibn 'Arabī full of symbolism, but he wasn't the first one to do that he only did as the *Ṣūfī* when they express their state, He and those who followed him resorted to the indication technique to avoid the conflict with the radical doctrines which prevailed the society at that time, therefore the efforts of Ibn 'Arabī in using symbolism and indication in his *Waḥdat al-Wujūd* doctrine.
- 3) Ibn 'Arabī's philosophy was based on mere Islamic *Ṣūfī* pillars, and in his life, he was tied to Islamic morals and went on his spiritual experience to its extreme. Knowing it's inside out.
- 4) The difficulty of his books was the main reason that the scholars scattered about him, consequently, the study of *Waḥdat al-Wujūd* as a whole needs great, numerous efforts and be dealt with in different aspects, as it is of *Ṣūfī* pillars, and comparing what was said about *Waḥdat al-Wujūd* in different civilized circles makes it difficult to achieve an objection position away of accusation.
- 5) Through the doctrine of *Waḥdat al-Wujūd* that Ibn 'Arabī adopted, we can understand the relationship between God, the world, and man. God, the creator created the world and wanted to see his manifestation and his image, so the world was his nominative and objective image that was surplus to his entity.
- 6) The *Insān* (person) in Ibn 'Arabī's point of view, is the perfect manifestation of God and represents God's presence in this world, when the world loses humans, it becomes a body without a soul. We mean here the *Insān al-kāmil* (the perfect man).

7) Ibn ‘Arabī also didn’t differ between men and women in their ability to achieve perfection, so the symbol of human perfection is for man and woman, so Ibn ‘Arabī-dealt with women at a higher level.

Finally, the study suggests areas for future research such Studying Ibn ‘Arabī’s style through the Šūfī dictionaries with clear indications of the departure to the source structure regarding many terms that are not understood outside the Šūfī Akbari environment (i.e. the environment of Ibn ‘Arabī’s disciples) such as the terms Šūfī mystical and dhikrī.

Abbreviations

W	Wāw – و
G	Jīm - ج
D	Dāl – د
ND	No date
H	Hijri date.
M	Gregorian date.
ED	Edition No.
P.	Page.

Author Contributions

Mohamed Elnakep: Conceptualization, Methodology, Resources, Software, Writing – original draft

Antonio Musarra: Methodology, Project administration, Resources, Software, Supervision, Writing – review & editing

Shalabi Elgeidi: Supervision, Writing – review & editing

Paolo Branca: Conceptualization, Data curation, Formal Analysis, Funding acquisition, Methodology, Supervision

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

References

- [1] Majma‘ al-lughah al-‘Arabīyah: (1985M) al-Mu‘jam al-Wasīṭ (Arabic Language Academy: Intermediate Dictionary), Cairo, (3rd ed), (part. 2 /p. 1058 - 1059).
- [2] Su‘ād al-Ḥakīm: (1981M) al-Mu‘jam al-P. ūfī al-Ḥikmah fī ḥudūd al-Kalimah (The Sufi Dictionary Wisdom in the Limits of the Word), DanOrganizationah lil-Ṭibā‘ah wa-al-Nashr, 1st ed., Lebanon, P. 1130-1153.
- [3] Abu Hamid Al-Ghazzālī: (2005M) Iḥyā’ ‘ulūm al-Dīn (Revival of the Religious Sciences) Published by: Ibn Ḥazm, Beirut – Lebanon, p 894.
- [4] Ibn Taymīyah: (ND), Majmoua Al-Rasaal Wa Al-Masaal (Messages and questions collection), commented by: Mohamed Rashed Reda, published by by Lajna Al-Turath Al-Arabi. Part 1 p. 68.
- [5] Umi Sumbulah, Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang: (2016M) Ibn ‘Arabī’s thought on what al wujud and Its Connection to Religious Diversity, Journal of Islamic Studies Published by Islamic Institute Mataram, p. 54 – 56.
- [6] Islam. A forged Hadeeth stating that Allaah was a hidden treasure. Available from: <https://www.islamweb.net/en/fatwa/14995/a-forged-hadeeth-stating-that-allaah-was-a-hidden-treasure>
- [7] William C. Chittick, Imaginal Worlds: (1994M) Ibn ‘Arabī and the Problem of Religious Diversity, Albany: State University of New York Press, p32.
- [8] Aḥmad ‘Abd al-‘Azīz al-Qap.īr: (2003M) ‘aqīdat al-P.ūfīyah wa-waḥdat al-wujūd al-khaḥfiyah (Sufi Doctrine and the Hidden Unity of Being), Published by: Al Rashd Library al-Rushd – Nāshirūn (Published byers), 1st ed, Riyadh - Saudi Arabia, P. 65 - 156.
- [9] Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn ‘Arabī: (1948M) Rasā’il Ibn ‘Arabī, (Ibn Arabi’s Letters), Ottoman Encyclopedia Society Press, Hai-Organization Ibad Deccan, 1st ed., Question No. 43, p. 29.
- [10] Harun Hadiwijono: (1983M) Sari Sejarah Filsafat Barat I (Yogyakarta, Kanisius, p28.
- [11] Muḥammad Ibrāhīm al-Fayyūmī: (1997M) al-Shaykh al-akbar Ibn ‘Arabī p. āhib al-Futūḥāt al-Makkīyah (The Greatest Sheikh Ibn Arabi, the author of Al-Futuhāt Al-Makkiyya), Published by: Beirut - Lebanon, p. 8 - 62.
- [12] Ṭāhā ‘Abd al-Bāqī Surūr: (ND) Muḥyī al-Dīn ibn ‘Arabī, Published by: Hindawi for Education and Culture, Cairo, p. 131.
- [13] Nazlah Aḥmad Nā’il al-Jubūrī: (2009M) Falsafat Waḥdat al-wujūd up. ūluḥā wfrthā al-Islāmīyah (The Philosophy of Unity of Being, Its Origins and Islamic Period), published by: Al-Masraf, Bahrain, P. 197.
- [14] Ibn ‘Arabī: (ND) al-Futūḥāt al-Makkīyah (Meccan Conquests), Investigation / Aḥmad Shams al-Dīn, Manshūrāt: Muḥammad ‘Alī Bayḍūn, published by: Scientific Books, Beirut, Lebanon, 3rd part, P. 174- 435.
- [15] Ibn ‘Arabī: (ND) Fuṣūṣ al-ḥukm (The gems of wisdom), Investigation: Abu al-Ala Afīfī – Published by: Al-Kitab al-Arabi – Beirut, Lebanon, Part1, P. 9 – 217.
- [16] Asīn blāsyws: (1965M) Ibn ‘Arabī ḥayātuhu wa-madhhabuhu, tarjamat (Ibn Arabi, his life and doctrine), translated by Dr. Abdul Rahman Badawi, Published by: Angelo Doctrinal Library, Cairo, pp. 6-8.
- [17] Ibn ‘Arabī: (1988M) al’srā ilā al-maqām al-Asrā “Kitāb al-Mi’rāj” (The Night Journey to the Station of the Night Journey “The Book of Ascension”), Investigation by: Suad Al-Hakim, Published by: DanOrganizationa for Medicine and Publishing, p. 15.
- [18] Al-Muqrī al-Tilimsānī: (ND) Nafḥ al-Ṭayyib min Ghup. n al-Andalus al-raḥīb (The fragrant scent of the humid Andalusian era), Investigation: Iḥsān ‘Abbās, Published by: P.ādir, p. 168.

- [19] ‘Abd al-Qādir Maḥmūd: (1966M) *al-falsafah al-P.ūfiyah fī al-Islām map.ādiruhā wa-nazarīyātihā wa-makānihā min al-Dīn wa-al-ḥayāh*, (Sufi Philosophy in Islam: Its Sources, Theories, and Place in Religion and Life), published by: Arab Thought Organization, Cairo, p. 109.
- [20] Naṣr Ḥāmid Abū Zayd: (1983M) *Falsafat al-ta’wīl fī Ta’wīl al-Qur’ān ‘inda Muḥyī al-Dīn ibn ‘Arabī*, (The Philosophy of Interpretation in the Interpretation of the Qur’an by Muḥyiddin Ibn Arabi), published by: Organization Al-Wahda, Beirut, 1983 AD, p. 38 -46.
- [21] Abū al-‘Ulā ‘Affī: (2009M) *al-falsafah al-P.ūfiyah ‘inda Muḥyī al-Dīn ibn ‘Arabī* (The Sufi Philosophers of Muḥyiddin Ibn Arabi), published by: The National Center for Translation, p. 21. 73.
- [22] Al-Sha’rānī: *al-yawāqīt wa-al-jawāhir* (Ruby and gem), p. 7.
- [23] Naseem Al-Sham. The Martyr Scholar Muhammad Saeed Ramadan Al-Bouti. Available from: https://naseemalsham.com/persons/muhammad_said_ramadan_al_bouti/fatwas/view/2017
- [24] Naṣr Ḥāmid Abū Zayd: (2002M) *Hākadhā takallama Ibn ‘Arabī* (Thus Spoke Ibn Arabi), published by: General Authority of Dar Al-Kitab, p. 24. 134.
- [25] ‘Abd al-Ḥaqq Ibn sab‘īn: (1428H = 2007M) *Anwār al-Nabī P. aly Allāh ‘alayhi wa-sallam, asrārḥā wa-anwā’ hā*, (The Lights of the Prophet, may God bless him and grant him peace, their secrets and types), Library of Al-Fuqaha’i School, p45.
- [26] Abī Naṣr al-Sarrāj al-Tūsī: (1960M) *Al-Luma’ fī Taṣawwuf* (Shine in Sufism), investigation: and graduation: Dr. Abdul Halim Mahmoud, published: Modern Books Authority, pp. 47 - 77.
- [27] Ibn ‘Arabī: (1954M) *‘Anqā’ Maghrib fī khatm al-awliyā’ wishes al-Maghrib* (Phoenix of the West in the Seal of the Saints and the Sun of the West), Investigation: Abdul-Baqi Ahmed Miftah, p. 38.
- [28] Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī (Authentic Hadiths by Bukhari): (1422H) *Saḥīḥ Al-Bukhari: (1422H) Hadith No. (6502)*, Investigation: Muhammad Zuhair bin Nabir Al-Nabir, Published by: Tawq Al-Najah, 1st ed. - Section 8, p. 105.
- [29] Titus Burckhardt: (1976M) *An Introduction to Sufi Doctrine*, England: Thorsons, p 28 -29.
- [30] Idries Shah, Mahkota Sufi: (2000M) *Menembus Dunia Ekstra Dimensi*, Translated by M. Hidayatullah and Roudlon (Surabaya: Risalah Gusti), p 192-193.
- [31] Sawai Makoto: (2017M) *Ibn Arabi on the perfect Man (al-insan al-kamil) as spiritual Authority: Caliph, Imam, and Saint, the Bridge of clusters: potentiality of Sufism*, Kenan Rifai Center for Sufi studies, Kyoto University, p. 50-52.
- [32] ‘Abd al-Ghanī ibn Ismā‘īl al-Nābulusī: *Sharḥ Jawāhir al-nuṣūṣ fī ḥall Kalimāt al-fuṣūṣ* (Explanation of the Jewels of Texts in Solving the Words of the Fusus), Investigation: Issam Ibrahim Al-Kayali, published by: Scientific Books Authority, part 1, P. 7 – 23.
- [33] Raan Davids, Yusef Waghid: (2019M) *Ibn al-Arabi’s Idea of Al-insan Al-kamil (the Perfect Human) and Democratic Education; Chapter1*, p70 – 74.
- [34] Patricia Crone, Martin Heinds: (2017M): *God's Caliph, the religious authority in the first Islamic Ages*, translated by: Ahmed Talat, revised by: Eman Abdulghany Nagm, Organization Josoor for publication and translation, Beirut- Lebanon, p. 57.
- [35] Ibn al-Qayyim al-Jawzīyah: (ND) *Madārij al-sālikīn fī Manāzil al-sā’ilīn* (The Stages of the Wayfarers in the Homes of the Arrived), published by: The Knowledge Tenders Authority, Riyadh - Saudi Arabia, Vol. 2, p. 46.
- [36] Asīn Balāthiyūs: (ND) *Ibn ‘Arabī ḥayātuhu wa-madhhabat* (Ibn Arabi his life and doctrines), p. 161.
- [37] Sā’id Khamīsī: (2010M) *Ibn ‘Arabī al-musāfir al-‘Ā’id* (Ibn Arabi, The Returning Traveler) , published by: Arab Science Publishers, 1st ed, p. 204.
- [38] Ibn ‘Arabī: (1988M) *Tanbīhāt ‘Alī ‘ulūm alḥqyqh wālmḥmdydh al-‘Āliyah* (Warnings on the Sciences of Truth and the High Muhammadanism), Investigation and commentary by Abdul Rahman Hassan Mahmoud, p. 41.
- [39] Al-Ṣādiq ‘Awaḍ Bashīr: (2014M) *Sirrah qūwat al-mar’ah ‘inda Ibn ‘Arabī* (The secret of women's strength according to Ibn Arabi), Published by: Arab Organization for Science and Technology, Beirut, Lebanon, pp. 31-39.
- [40] Ṭālib Jāsim al-‘Anzī: (2012M) *Waḥdat al-wujūd ‘inda Ibn ‘Arabī min manzūr astshrāqy* (The unity of being in Ibn Arabi from an oriental perspective), ed. 27, p. 422.
- [41] Nuzhat rādh: (2008M) *al-unūthah fī fikr Ibn ‘Arabī*, Phenomena in the Thought of Ibn Arabi), published by: Al-Saqi Authority, Beirut, Lebanon, p. 144 – 154.